

ÖSTERREICHISCHE AKADEMIE DER WISSENSCHAFTEN
PHILOSOPHISCH-HISTORISCHE KLASSE
DENKSCHRIFTEN, 424. BAND

HELMUT KRASSER, HORST LASIC,
ELI FRANCO, BIRGIT KELLNER (ED.)

Religion and Logic in Buddhist Philosophical Analysis

Proceedings of the Fourth International Dharmakīrti Conference
Vienna, August 23–27, 2005

Verlag der
Österreichischen Akademie
der Wissenschaften



OAW

HELMUT KRASSER, HORST LASIC, ELI FRANCO, BIRGIT KELLNER (ED.)

Religion and Logic in Buddhist Philosophical Analysis
Proceedings of the Fourth International Dharmakīrti Conference
Vienna, August 23–27, 2005

ÖSTERREICHISCHE AKADEMIE DER WISSENSCHAFTEN
PHILOSOPHISCH-HISTORISCHE KLASSE
DENKSCHRIFTEN, 424. BAND

Beiträge zur Kultur- und Geistesgeschichte Asiens

Nr. 69

ÖSTERREICHISCHE AKADEMIE DER WISSENSCHAFTEN
PHILOSOPHISCH-HISTORISCHE KLASSE
DENKSCHRIFTEN, 424. BAND

HELMUT KRASSER, HORST LASIC,
ELI FRANCO, BIRGIT KELLNER (ED.)

Religion and Logic in Buddhist Philosophical Analysis

Proceedings of the Fourth International Dharmakīrti Conference
Vienna, August 23–27, 2005

Verlag der
Österreichischen Akademie
der Wissenschaften



Wien 2011

OAW

Vorgelegt von k. M. HELMUT KRASSER in der Sitzung am 17. Dezember 2010

British Library Cataloguing in Publication data
A Catalogue record of this book is available from the British Library

Die verwendeten Papiersorten sind aus chlorfrei gebleichtem Zellstoff hergestellt,
frei von säurebildenden Bestandteilen und alterungsbeständig.

Alle Rechte vorbehalten

ISBN 978-3-7001-7000-6

Copyright © 2011 by
Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften
Wien

Druck und Bindung: Prime Rate kft., Budapest

Printed and bound in the EU

<http://hw.oeaw.ac.at/7000-6>

<http://verlag.oeaw.ac.at>

Contents

Frontispiece: Participants at the conference	v
Preface.....	ix
Account of the Fourth International Dharmakīrti Conference in Vienna, August 23–27, 2005	
Program	xi
List of participants	xv
Ernst Steinkellner, Opening speech – News from the manuscript department	xvii

Proceedings

Piotr Balcerowicz, Dharmakīrti’s criticism of the Jaina doctrine of multiplexity of reality (<i>anekāntavāda</i>).....	1
Junjie Chu, Sanskrit fragments of Dharmakīrti’s <i>Santānāntarasiddhi</i>	33
Vincent Eltschinger, Studies on Dharmakīrti’s religious philosophy (3): Compassion and its role in the general structure of PV 2	43
Koji Ezaki, Can we say that everything is ineffable? Udayana’s refutation of the theory of <i>apoha</i>	73
Eli Franco, Perception of yogis – Some epistemological and metaphysical considerations	81
Toru Funayama, Kamalaśīla’s view on yogic perception and the bodhisattva paths	99
Brendan S. Gillon, Dharmakīrti on inference from effect. A discussion of verse 12 and the <i>Svavṛtti</i> of the <i>Svārthānumāna</i> chapter of the <i>Pramāṇavārttika</i>	113
Klaus Glashoff, Problems of transcribing <i>avinābhāva</i> into predicate logic	131
Keijin Hayashi, Prajñākaragupta’s interpretation of mental perception	139
Yoshichika Honda, Bhoja and Dharmakīrti	151
Pascale Hugon, Phya pa Chos kyi seng ge’s views on perception	159
Masahiro Inami, Nondual cognition	177
Hisataka Ishida, On the classification of <i>anyāpoha</i>	197
Takashi Iwata, Compassion in Buddhist logic – Dharmakīrti’s view of compassion as interpreted by Prajñākaragupta	211

Kyō Kanō, Dichotomy, <i>antarvyāpti</i> , and <i>dṛṣṭānta</i>	231
Kei Kataoka, Manu and the Buddha for Kumārila and Dharmakīrti	255
Shoryu Katsura, From Abhidharma to Dharmakīrti – With a special reference to the concept of <i>svabhāva</i>	271
Yohei Kawajiri, A critique of the Buddhist theory of <i>adhyavasāya</i> in the Pratyabhijñā school	281
Birgit Kellner, Dharmakīrti’s criticism of external realism and the sliding scale of analysis	291
Hisayasu Kobayashi, On the development of the argument to prove <i>vijñaptimātratā</i>	299
Taiken Kyuma, On the (im)perceptibility of external objects in Dharmakīrti’s epistemology	309
Lawrence McCrea, Prajñākaragupta on the <i>pramāṇas</i> and their objects	319
Shinya Moriyama, <i>pramāṇapariśuddhasakalatattvajñā</i> , <i>sarvajñā</i> and <i>sarvasarvajñā</i>	329
Yasutaka Muroya, Bhāsarvajña’s Interpretation of <i>bhāva eva nāśaḥ</i> and a related chrono- logical problem.	341
Hiroshi Nemoto, The proof of impermanence in the dGe lugs pa’s <i>pramāṇa</i> theory	363
Miyako Notake, The concept of <i>samayābhoga</i> in the refutation of the existence of universals.	375
Hideyo Ogawa, On the term <i>anupalabdhi</i>	395
Masamichi Sakai, Śākyabuddhi and Dharmottara on the inference of momentariness based on the absence of external causes of destruction	407
Kiyokuni Shiga, <i>antarvyāpti</i> and <i>bahirvyāpti</i> re-examined	423
John Taber, Did Dharmakīrti think the Buddha had desires?	437
Tom J.F. Tillemans, Dignāga, Bhāviveka and Dharmakīrti on <i>apoha</i>	449
Toshikazu Watanabe, Dharmakīrti’s intention to quote <i>Pramāṇasamuccaya</i> III 12	459
Jeson Woo, Vācaspatimiśra and Jñānaśrīmitra on the object of <i>yogipratyakṣa</i>	469
Zhihua Yao, Non-cognition and the third <i>pramāṇa</i>	477
Chizuko Yoshimizu, What makes all the produced impermanent? Proof of impermanence and theory of causality	491
Kiyotaka Yoshimizu, Reconsidering the fragment of the <i>Bṛhaṭṭīkā</i> on restriction (<i>niyama</i>)	507

Preface

The Fourth International Dharmakīrti Conference was held at the Europahaus Congress Centre in Vienna from August 23 to 27, 2005.¹ It was organized and convened by the Institute for the Cultural and Intellectual History of Asia of the Austrian Academy of Sciences. We would like to acknowledge the generous support and sponsorship of the Austrian Academy of Sciences, as it enabled not only the conference to be held, but also the proceedings to be published. Due to various circumstances, the publication of the proceedings has been delayed far too long, for which we deeply apologize.

A few of the papers that were read at the conference have, for various reasons, not been included in this volume, while one that could not be presented at that time has been (T. Tillemans). All of the papers by authors whose native language is not English were corrected by Cynthia Peck-Kubaczek and we are very grateful for her painstaking efforts.

Since the first Dharmakīrti conference in 1982, the availability of works by and related to Dharmakīrti has improved radically. In the preface to the proceedings of the second conference (see below, n. 1) Steinkellner reported “that the lost Sanskrit originals of the *Pramāṇaviniścaya* and the *Hetubindu* are extant in China and will be available sooner or later” (p. ix). A few days before the fourth conference began, the first copies of a critical and diplomatic edition of the first chapter of Jinendrabuddhi’s *Pramāṇasamuccayaṭīkā* arrived in Vienna, in time to be presented to the participants.² In his opening speech at the conference, “News from the manuscript department” (see below, p. xvii), Steinkellner was already in the position to present an impressive list of texts of the Buddhist epistemological tradition, the “*pramāṇa* school,” that are reported to be still extant in their Sanskrit original, including the *Pramāṇaviniścaya* and the *Hetubindu*. In the meantime, a critical edition of the Sanskrit text of the *Pramāṇaviniścaya* has

¹ A “Report on the First International Dharmakīrti Conference at Kyōto, June 16 and 17, 1982” by Yūichi Kajiyama is printed on p. xi of: Ernst Steinkellner (ed.), *Studies in the Buddhist epistemological tradition. Proceedings of the Second International Dharmakīrti Conference, Vienna, June 11–16, 1989*. Wien 1991. The proceedings of the third conference have been edited by Shoryu Katsura, *Dharmakīrti’s thought and its impact on Indian and Tibetan philosophy. Proceedings of the Third International Dharmakīrti Conference, Hiroshima, November 4–6, 1997*. Wien 1999.

² Ernst Steinkellner, Helmut Krasser, Horst Lasic, *Jinendrabuddhi’s Viśālāmalavatī Pramāṇasamuccayaṭīkā, chapter 1. Part I: Critical edition; Part II: Diplomatic edition with a manuscript description* by Anne Mac-Donald. (Sanskrit Texts from the Tibetan Autonomous Region 1/I+II) Beijing/Vienna 2005. The edition of the second chapter is nearly finished and will see the light of day in the summer of 2011.

KWIC-indices to the editions are being published in cooperation with Prof. Jun Takashima, Institute for the Study of Languages and Cultures of Asia and Africa, Tokyo University of Foreign Studies. A KWIC-index for the first chapter of Jinendrabuddhi’s *Ṭīkā* and for Dharmakīrti’s works can be downloaded at <http://www.aatufs.ac.jp/~tjun/data/kwic/>

been published, the first two chapters by Steinkellner himself,³ and the third chapter by Pascale Hugon and Toru Tomabechi.⁴ Work on Dharmottara's commentary, the *Pramāṇaviniścayaṭīkā*, which in 2005 Steinkellner still listed under the group of texts "which may become available" (see below, p. xx, nos. 2a, 2b) has meanwhile begun.

This change for the better not only concerns our Sanskrit sources for the Buddhist epistemological school, but pertains to Tibetan sources as well. Since the first Dharmakīrti conference, a number of important works on Dharmakīrti's *Pramāṇaviniścaya* have become available:⁵ the huge commentary by gTsañ nag pa (*Tshad ma rnam par ñes pa'i ñi ka legs bśad bsdus pa*), rÑog lo Blo ldan śes rab's explanation of the work's difficult points (*Tshad ma rnam ñes kyi dka' gnas rnam bśad*), Phya pa Chos kyi señ ge's commentary (*Tshad ma rnam par ñes pa'i 'grel bśad yi ge dañ rigs pa'i gnad la 'jug pa'i śes rab kyi 'od zer*) and synoptic table (*Tshad ma rnam ñes bsdus don*), and Chu mig pa's commentary (*Tshad ma rnam par ñes pa'i 'grel pa*). But also independent works on the Buddhist *pramāṇa* theories are included in these newly available texts: Phya pa Chos kyi señ ge's summary of epistemology (*Tshad ma yid kyi mun sel*), mTshur ston's summary of epistemology (*Tshad ma śes rab sgron ma*), Chu mig pa's summary of Dharmakīrti's seven epistemological works (*Tshad ma sde bdun gyi don phyogs gcig tu bsdus pa*), and another summary of epistemology wrongly attributed to Kloñ chen pa (*Tshad ma'i de kho na ñid bsdus pa*). And in addition to these texts of gSañ phu-related authors, the three sets, ninety volumes altogether, of the *bKa' gdams gsuñ 'bum* that came out in 2006, 2007 and 2009, which contain copies of texts that were preserved in the library of 'Bras spuñs Monastery in Central Tibet, contain nineteen more works on epistemology that are either attributed to unknown authors or not attributed at all.

Here, only gSañ phu-related texts have been mentioned, and while the number of Sanskrit texts that have been edited or made otherwise accessible is impressive, it is only a small fraction of what is extant. It is hence clear that there is a huge amount of material that still needs to be studied, edited and included in our picture of Dharmakīrti, our understanding of his religio-philosophical theories, and our knowledge of his influence and impact on later Indian and Tibetan thinkers. Thus, we are in the exciting if overwhelming position of knowing that this volume is only a small step in our approach toward the thinker Dharmakīrti, a fact which, while leaving us humble, also allows us to be grateful that our curiosity has not yet been satisfied.

September 2010

³ Ernst Steinkellner, *Dharmakīrti's Pramāṇaviniścaya, chapters 1 and 2*. (Sanskrit Texts from the Tibetan Autonomous Region 2) Beijing/Vienna 2007.

⁴ Pascale Hugon and Toru Tomabechi, *Dharmakīrti's Pramāṇaviniścaya, chapter 3*. With a preface by Tom J.F. Tillemans. (Sanskrit Texts from the Tibetan Autonomous Region 8) Beijing/Vienna 2010.

⁵ The following list is based on a table prepared by Pascale Hugon which kindly was put at my proposal.

Account of the Fourth International Dharmakīrti Conference in Vienna, August 23–27, 2005

Program

Monday, August 22

6:00–9:00 *pm* Registration (“Haus 1”, ground floor next to the reception)

Tuesday, August 23

9:00–10:00 *am* Registration

Morning session (Chair: Prof. Takashi Iwata)

10:00 *am* Opening Address by Prof. Ernst Steinkellner, Director of the Institute for the Cultural and Intellectual History of Asia of the Austrian Academy of Sciences

10:30 *am* – Break –

11:00 *am* Chizuko Yoshimizu, “Dharmakīrti’s challenges to establish the impermanence of all the produced”

11:30 *am* Klaus Glashoff, “Problems of transcribing *avinābhāva* and *trairūpya* into predicate logic”

Afternoon session (Chair: Prof. Shoryu Katsura)

2:00 *pm* Birgit Kellner, “Climbing up or sliding down: Scales of analysis in Dharmakīrti’s exposition of *pramāṇa* and *pramāṇaphala*”

2:30 *pm* Taiken Kyuma, “On the perceptibility of external objects in Dharmakīrti’s epistemology”

3:00 *pm* Lawrence McCrea, “Prajñākaragupta on the *pramāṇas* and their objects”

3:30 *pm* – Break –

4:00 *pm* Masahiro Inami, “Nondual cognition”

4:30 *pm* Hisayasu Kobayashi, “On the development of the argument to prove *vijñapti-mātratā*”

5:30 *pm* Get-together party in the “Orangerie”

Wednesday, August 24

Morning session (Chair: Prof. Motoi Ono)

- 9:00 *am* Yasutaka Muroya, “One aspect of Bhāsarvajña’s interpretations of *kṣaṇika-tva*”
- 9:30 *am* Masamichi Sakai, “Śākyabuddhi and Dharmottara on *vināśitvānumāna*”
- 10:00 *am* Hiroshi Nemoto, “Proof of the impermanence in dGe lugs pa’s *pramāṇa* theory”
- 10:30 *am* – Break –
- 11:00 *am* Hideyo Ogawa, “On the term *anupalabdhi*”
- 11:30 *am* Zhihua Yao, “Non-Cognition: Some further sources”

Afternoon session (Chair: Prof. Klaus Glashoff)

- 2:00 *pm* Kiyotaka Yoshimizu, “Reconsidering the Bṛhaṭṭīkā fragments on *avinābhāva* and *niyama*”
- 2:30 *pm* Toshikazu Watanabe, “On the role of an opponent in the ascertainment of three characteristics of logical reason”
- 3:00 *pm* Kiyokuni Shiga, “*antarvyāpti* and *bahirvyāpti* re-examined”
- 3:30 *pm* – Break –
- 4:00 *pm* Tatsuhiko Shiraishi, “Jñānaśrīmitra’s two interpretations of *bādhakapramāṇa*”
- 4:30 *pm* Kyo Kano, “Incorporating of *pakṣa* with *sapakṣa*”
- 5:00 *pm* Toshihiko Kimura, “Misapplication of Reduction to Absurdity by Indian logicians in contrast to Dharmakīrti”

Thursday, August 25

Morning session (Chair: Prof. Toru Funayama)

- 9:00 *am* Junjie Chu, “Sanskrit fragments of Dharmakīrti’s *Santānāntarasiddhi*”
- 9:30 *am* Vincent Eltschinger, “On newly available Sanskrit manuscripts of Śāṅkara-nandana: The relative chronology and confessional identity of his works”
- 10:00 *am* Leonard J.W. van der Kuijp, “On bTsun pa sTon gZon and his *Pramāṇavārttika* commentary”
- 10:30 *am* – Break –
- 11:00 *am* Pascale Hugon, “Phya pa Chos kyi seṅ ge’s views on direct perception”
- 11:30 *am* Keijin Hayashi, “Prajñākaragupta’s interpretation of mental perception”

Afternoon

- 2:00 *pm* Outing: walk through the woods followed by wine and dinner at a traditional Viennese “Heuriger” tavern. (Heuriger Nikisch, 1190 Vienna, Sieveringer Straße 172, Tel.: 440 13 65); Meeting point in front of “Haus 1” at 2:00 pm; Bus departure at 2:30 pm.

Friday, August 26

Morning session (Chair: Prof. Chizuko Yoshimizu)

- 9:00 *am* John Taber, “Did Dharmakīrti think that the Buddha had desires?”
- 9:30 *am* Kei Kataoka, “Manu and the Buddha for Kumārila and Dharmakīrti”
- 10:00 *am* Takashi Iwata, “Compassion in Buddhist logic – Dharmakīrti’s compassion based on Prajñākaragupta’s interpretation”
- 10:30 *am* – Break –
- 11:00 *am* Shinya Moriyama, “*pramāṇapariśuddhasakalatattvajña, sarvajña* and *sarvasarvajña*”
- 11:30 *am* Chisho Namai, “Śāntarakṣita on *cintāmaṇi*”

Afternoon session (Chair: Prof. Leonard J.W. van der Kuijp)

- 2:00 *pm* Eli Franco, “Perception of Yogis – Some epistemological and metaphysical presuppositions”
- 2:30 *pm* Toru Funayama, “Kamalaśīla’s view on yogic perception and the Bodhisattva paths”
- 3:00 *pm* Jeson Woo, “Vācaspatimiśra and Jñānaśrīmitra on the object of *yogipratyakṣa*”
- 3:30 *pm* – Break –
- 4:00 *pm* John Dunne, “*yogipratyakṣa*: The perception of universals?”
- 4:30 *pm* Miyako Notake, “*samayābhoga* in the refutation of universals”

Saturday, August 27

Morning session (Chair: Prof. John Dunne)

- 9:00 *am* Parimal G. Patil, “Dharmakīrti’s white lie: Jñānaśrīmitra on the history of Buddhist philosophy in India”
- 9:30 *am* Koji Ezaki, “Can we say that everything is ineffable?: Udayana’s refutation of the theory of *apoha*”
- 10:00 *am* Hisataka Ishida, “On the classification of *anyāpoha*”
- 10:30 *am* – Break –
- 11:00 *am* Shoryu Katsura, “Dharmakīrti’s concept of *svabhāva*”
- 11:30 *am* Brendan Gillon, “Dharmakīrti and the Principle of a Plurality of Causes”

Afternoon session (Chair: Prof. Masahiro Inami)

- 2:00 *pm* Yoshichika Honda, “Bhoja and Dharmakīrti”
- 2:30 *pm* Yohei Kawajiri, “A critique of the Buddhist theory of *adhyavasāya* in the Pratyabhijñā school”
- 3:00 *pm* Tomoyuki Uno, “On the theory of inference in Jaina exegetical literature”
- 3:30 *pm* – Break –
- 4:00 *pm* Piotr Balcerowicz, “Dharmakīrti’s criticism of Jaina *anekānta*”

List of participants

1. Balcerowicz, Piotr
2. Chu, Junjie
3. Dunne, John
4. Eltschinger, Vincent
5. Ezaki, Koji
6. Franco, Eli
7. Funayama, Toru
8. Gillon, Brendan
9. Glashoff, Klaus
10. Hayashi, Keijin
11. Honda, Yoshichika
12. Hugon, Pascale
13. Ichigo, Masamichi
14. Inami, Masahiro
15. Ishida, Hisataka
16. Iwata, Takashi
17. Kano, Kyo
18. Kataoka, Kei
19. Katsura, Shoryu
20. Kawajiri, Yohei
21. Kellner, Birgit
22. Kimura, Toshihiko
23. Kobayashi, Hisayasu
24. Krasser, Helmut
25. Kyuma, Taiken
26. Lasic, Horst
27. Maeda, Hidekazu
28. McCrea, Lawrence
29. McKeown, Arthur
30. Miyo, Mai
31. Moriyama, Shinya
32. Much, Michael Torsten
33. Muroya, Yasutaka
34. Namai, Chisho
35. Nemoto, Hiroshi
36. Notake, Miyako
37. Ogawa, Hideyo
38. Okada, Kenscho
39. O'Leary, Joseph
40. Ono, Motoi
41. Patil, Parimal G.
42. Pecchia, Cristina
43. Prets, Ernst
44. Sadhukhan, Sanjit Kumar
45. Saito, Akira
46. Sakai, Masamichi
47. Shiga, Kiyokuni
48. Shiraishi, Tatsuhiko
49. Steinkellner, Ernst
50. Taber, John
51. Tohi, Koho
52. Uno, Tomoyuki
53. van der Kuijp, Leonard J.W.
54. Watanabe, Toshikazu
55. Woo, Jeson
56. Yao, Zhihua
57. Yoshimizu, Chizuko
58. Yoshimizu, Kiyotaka

Organizing committee and supporting staff

Helmut Krasser, Horst Lasic, Birgit Kellner, Eli Franco, Cynthia Peck-Kubaczek

